

## DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 391 706

SO 025 754

AUTHOR Nelson, Murry R.  
TITLE Directionless from Birth: The National Council for the Social Studies, 1921-1937.  
PUB DATE Nov 95  
NOTE 22p.  
PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070)  
  
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.  
DESCRIPTORS \*Educational History; Elementary Secondary Education; Faculty Organizations; \*History; \*National Organizations; \*Professional Associations; Social History; Social Science Research; \*Social Studies; \*Teacher Associations  
IDENTIFIERS \*National Council for the Social Studies

## ABSTRACT

This paper recounts the early years of the National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS), from its 1921 beginnings and partnership with the National Education Association. NCSS began as a service organization to close the gap between social scientists and secondary school teachers and to reexamine knowledge within the disciplines in light of potential use in schools. NCSS was founded by five practitioner-researchers, but the organization was taken over by two hard working entrepreneurs with little vision other than an organizing spirit. NCSS emerged directionless from birth. Many in higher education with deep interest in the social sciences and professional organizations became very interested in NCSS and its influence in the school curriculum. These alliances allowed for the Council to meet on neutral ground. NCSS allied early with the National Education Association (NEA) and the American Historical Association (AHA). Although it was never a formal part of the AHA, the AHA provided financial support for many years. From 1925 to 1969, NCSS was officially part of NEA as its Department of Social Studies. For the first 10 years, NCSS campaigned for members to give it life. By the late 1920s NCSS had begun to gain the interest of teachers; by the 1930s the Council attracted educators and social scientists with more pronounced academic views and involvement. NCSS had a few women officers in the early years but many were involved with Committees and Yearbook chapters. This history laments that little has changed in the nearly 60 years as NCSS still struggles for acceptance, membership, intellectual respect, and a political voice in the debate on schools. (EH)

\*\*\*\*\*  
\* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made \*  
\* from the original document. \*  
\*\*\*\*\*

Murray Nelson

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES  
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC):

☒ This document has been reproduced as  
received from the person or organization  
originating it

☐ Minor changes have been made to  
improve reproduction quality

• Points of view or opinions stated in this  
document do not necessarily represent  
official OERI position or policy

### Directionless from Birth:

## The National Council for the Social Studies, 1921-1937

A note on method and source is needed before beginning. From its inception NCSS relied on The Historical Outlook as an unofficial and later, official avenue of communication. The journal carried all news, membership and dues discussions, the various constitutions and the first NCSS Yearbooks, though the yearbooks would begin again at a later date. Thus, if one were desirous of reinterpreting the years 1921 to 1937 in a manner different from my views, one must still begin with a reading of The Historical Outlook, which became The Social Studies in 1934; a different view of NCSS could be seen from using this same source. The Historical Outlook was published by McKinley Publishing, not NCSS. Starting in 1937, Social Education was the official NCSS publication. Louis Vanaria's dissertation (1957) on NCSS relies most heavily on this source, even more than the NCSS archives.

Yearbooks from 1931 (when they "officially" begin) are also useful to get some idea of issues, topics and authors. The first bulletins of NCSS, begun in 1927, would be useful sources if it were not so difficult to find copies.

### The Early Years of NCSS

First steps toward the National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS) were taken in 1920 and its organizational meeting was held at the Department of Superintendence meetings of the National Education Association in Atlantic City, March 3, 1921. NCSS was inspired by the Northeastern Illinois Social Science Roundtable developed by Earle Rugg, which met at the Chicago YMCA in 1919. Rugg was then a high school teacher in Oak Park, Illinois, a suburb of Chicago, and he contacted social scientists and teachers of history and social studies as the nucleus of the group. When Rugg went east in September 1920, to Teachers College as a graduate student to work with W. C. Bagley, he contacted some other "social studies professionals"—Daniel Knowlton, Harold Rugg (Earle's older brother), Roy Hatch, J. Montgomery Gambrill—and the five decided to form a new group based on the ideas of the Northeastern Illinois Social Science Roundtable. This new organization was called the National Council of Teachers of Social Studies, but soon changed to the National Council for the Social Studies. Its stated purpose was "to bring about the association and cooperation of teachers of social studies (history, government, economics, sociology, etc.) and of administrators, supervisors, teachers of education and others interested in obtaining the maximum results in education for citizenship through social studies (A National Council, 144).

At its organizational meeting, this group elected Albert McKinley as its first president. McKinley was editor of the The Historical Outlook and a member of the American Historical

Association Committee on History Teaching in the Schools. Keels discusses McKinley and his role in The Social Studies journal in a recent article (Sept-Oct 1994). Rolla Tryon, of the University of Chicago, an AHA stalwart, was elected vice-president, and Edgar Dawson of Hunter College was elected secretary-treasurer. Both had been members of earlier AHA Committees. Earle Rugg was named Assistant Secretary (A National Council, 1921).

According to Earle Rugg, "The eastern boys froze us out, Albert McKinley and Edgar Dawson" (E. Rugg, 1966 also W. Murra, 1970). The meeting only laid the groundwork for a permanent institution which would be shaped largely by the newly elected executive committee. The president was "to appoint an Advisory Board of fifteen members" (A National Council, 144), and these appointments began to shape NCSS. Almost immediately NCSS began to be "a player" in the debate about the school curriculum. Boozer notes that "in 1921 ten . . . committees representing these fields (e.g. history, civics, economics, and sociology) were busy at work making recommendations for the school curriculum. These committees, and their predecessors, had, in most cases, worked independently of each other" (Boozer, 1960, 164). Thus, pressure was growing to include all of these social sciences in the school curriculum. It was noted that the social studies needed much more attention in school. "But it is not certain that all have learned that the social studies constitute a group of subjects which must be viewed as a group and not as separate disciplines, wholly independent of each other. There still remains a tendency among the historians, economists, political scientists and sociologists to work too independently of each other" (A National Council, 144).

NCSS had representatives from a number of social science groups, particularly the AHA, and urged the secretaries of these organizations, "to assist by getting their members to join the council" (Rugg, 1921, 190). Later that year, however, Dawson wrote that these organizations had "turned out to be a handicap in the development of these {social} studies" (Dawson, 1921, 330). Each subject wanted to be sure it was adequately represented in the schools and "the historians feel that there is a danger of history being replaced by a patchwork collection of unrelated and unsystematic material" (Dawson, 1921, 330).

At an AHA conference in St. Louis in 1921, the theme was "Desirable Adjustments Between History and the other Social Studies in Elementary and Secondary Schools." This was discussed in the AHA Report of 1921 (AHA, Annual Report, 1921, pp. 121-124) and in February 1922 the lead paper of that conference, by R. M. Tryon, was published in The Historical Outlook. One of the conclusions of the conference was that, though the AHA was very supportive of this new body (NCSS), it was still a bit nervous, fearing the weakening of history in schools. Thus, the AHA suggested a joint Commission be formed to represent the interests of the various scholarly groups to be represented under the new umbrella, NCSS. The AHA Executive Council expressed its approval of the NCSS and "noted that the desired cooperation

with other associations can best be obtained through a council, or joint body, embracing representatives of the organizations concerned" (AHA, 1921, 59-60). Dawson noted that "this movement [toward a Commission] was stimulated by a conference which met in Pittsburgh at the call of Professor Marshall and which represented economists, sociologists, political scientists and schools of business" to support rather than replace the National Council (Dawson, 1922a, 46). Dawson went on to note that a commission of scholars was insufficient without "representative school administrators and students of education including curriculum makers . . . What the commission lacks, the National Council has—contact with the teachers" (Dawson, 1922, 46-47).

Thus, in December 1921, a Joint Commission on the Presentation of Social Studies in Schools was first discussed and formed through the AHA with two specific tasks—to continue "The study of the presentation of social studies in secondary schools and to plan appropriate cooperation with other agencies working in the same field" (Report of the Joint Commission, 1923, 53). Two representatives from AHA (Arthur Schlesinger and Henry Johnson), the American Economic Association (W. H. Kierkhofer and L. C. Marshall), the American Political Science Association (R. G. Gettell and W. J. Shepard), the American Sociological Society (R. L. Finney and E. C. Hayes), the National Council of Geography Teachers (Edith Parker and R. D. Calkins) and the Association of Collegiate Schools of Business (again, Marshall and C. I. Ruggles) met as a group in 1922 and agreed to keep meeting with the associations' support. The AHA supported that with a number of caveats, among which was the request that this Commission become part of the Executive Council governing body of NCSS. The Commission saw itself as having a number of matters to concern itself with, among which were "a social study program from elementary and secondary schools, the history of the teaching of the social studies and current experiments in the presentation of the social studies" (Annual Report, 1923, 54).

Those caveats were heeded by NCSS, and the NCSS Board of Directors was composed of representatives of each of the various social science associations until 1928. Also added were representatives from the Department of Superintendence of the NEA, the NAEP, the NASSP, the National Council of Normal School Principals, the National Society of College Teachers of Education, the New England History Teachers Association, the Mississippi Valley Historical Association, and the Pacific Coast Branch of the AHA.

The Commission (but not NCSS) received a grant from the Commonwealth Fund in 1923 to do "a study of the experiments in teaching the social studies by J. Montgomery Gambrill of Teachers College" (News, 1923, 191). Thus, the Commission was addressing one of six of its stated avenues for study. Meanwhile, this new spirit of cooperation moved NCSS to the forefront of social studies and the examination of those aspects of the school curriculum. Dawson noted that had the founders of NCSS known that there'd be such an outpouring of

cooperation from the associations, it would have been attempted at the founding of NCSS. Dawson observed that, "The members of the established associations seemed to think that it was better for them either to stay out of the movement or to take an active part in its guidance" (Dawson, 1922b, 317). Fearing that they would be shut out of the curriculum, the associations chose to get involved, and NCSS seemed to be the most objective vehicle within which to do so. Though all of the social science associations wanted greater influence, they voluntarily compromised on NCSS as a "broker" of the social studies in schools and, led by the AHA, began to popularize the use of the term social studies within their associations.

Earlier in 1922, Dawson had noted one of the initial (and long-standing) problems of NCSS—its choice of names (Dawson, 1922b, 46):

One thing that stands out in the way of some who would like to support the National Council more freely than they do as yet is its name. The title, "Social Studies" is not fully understood; possibly it is not subject as yet to logical definition . . . The term "social studies" was used for lack of a better one—one that would not be so cumbersome as to hamper facile discussions of the elements of this field.

Dawson went on to note that a fight over the term may not be good tactics and that some might see the term as typical of a "vicarious educational tendency." He found that intolerable, if true, but "it remains to be proved that the expression will necessarily do that."

The chief goal of NCSS in its earliest years seemed to be gaining members. An initial modest goal was to try to get a member in each state, then to initiate them in state-wide membership drives. At the February 1922 meeting in Chicago, this was a key topic of discussion as was the first NCSS constitution approved at that meeting held in Chicago at the Central YMCA.

Another early proposed task was to compile minutes of various summer social studies conferences held at leading universities. These minutes were to be kept for the use of NCSS, collated in the NCSS offices and subsequently published in The Historical Outlook (Social Studies in the Summer Schools, 1922, 227). This might have been a worthwhile project, but a serious lack of volunteers most likely led to the project never being actually implemented, since there is no further mention of this information in The Historical Outlook.

In December Secretary-Treasurer Dawson published what was to be his first annual summary of NCSS plans and progress. This entire issue was edited by Dawson as the first Yearbook of the National Council for the Social Studies. Short articles on characteristic elements of the social studies were authored by prominent professors. These included history by Henry Johnson, government by Dawson himself, economics by L. C. Marshall, sociology by Ross Finney and E. C. Hayes and geography by W. W. Atwood. Also included were two other chapters authored after the first ones that provided different perspectives. One was geography by

J. R. Smith and the other sociology by Franklin Giddings whose influence, direct and indirect, on the 1916 Committee on Social Studies is discussed in Lybarger (1981), Saxe (1991) and Correia (1993). A later article in the Yearbook was authored by J. Lynn Barnard, secretary of the 1916 Committee on the Social Studies.

The plans for NCSS included notice of the next meeting in March (later moved up a week to February 1923) in Cleveland with the Department of Superintendence of NEA. At that meeting the first revision of the new constitution would be presented for discussion. NCSS still was seeking members to both join and help with surveys. In that same issue NCSS ran an advertisement seeking new members (367) in which was listed the NCSS officers and advisory board.

Vanaria observes that (100) "the 25 members who comprised the officers, executive committee and advisory board in 1921 numbered 14 college professors, a state director of social studies instruction, a superintendent of schools, a high school principal and three high school teachers of history" (one of whom was Bessie L. Pierce who joined the history faculty at the University of Iowa the following year). He surmised that the group had few teachers because of a lack of perceived need by teachers for a national organization or because of a willingness to allow professors to do the organizational spadework. Since meetings were held at a time and place that most teachers could not go to because of teaching commitments, their participation was limited.

The effects of the NCSS ad is difficult to assay since membership statistics are irregular and incomplete until 1935 when a systematic annual report was initiated (Vanaria, 106). Nevertheless, by 1923 there were NCSS members in all states and in Canada. In 1922, 60 of the members had been from ten states with 25% from New York and Pennsylvania. The distribution in 1922 was as follows for the 790 members of NCSS (Vanaria, 105):

Northeast	350
Southeast	60
Southwest	22
North Central	227
Northwest	57
Far West	58
Others (Canada)	16

In 1923 a column in The Historical Outlook on news in the associations first discussed NCSS. A later column, "News of the National Council for the Social Studies," ran in all eight

(Jan-May, Oct-Dec) issues of The Historical Outlook starting in 1926. The former NCSS column in April of 1923 included synopses of the papers from the annual meeting in Cleveland, a listing of all NCSS board members and the groups that they represented and a listing of the five person executive committee with their institutional affiliation.

In May of 1923, the news column noted that NCSS would have several programs arranged for the NEA conference in July in Oakland/San Francisco. It was also noted that, "We should soon have 5000 members."

In October those meetings held in July were reported as having had "more than 500 in attendance . . . to an excellent response" (286).

The December issue of The Historical Outlook was largely devoted to the second Yearbook of NCSS which existed in its entirety in that journal. Articles on practices, texts, the status of social studies in certain states and Dawson's report on NCSS progress constituted the Yearbook "chapters." In addition, J. Montgomery Gambrill's report, "Experimental Curriculum Making in Social Studies," appeared in The Historical Outlook as part of the Second Yearbook of NCSS. The report had four parts, each of which focused on one "experiment." These included social studies in the University High School of the University of Chicago, a unified Social Science Curriculum proposed by H. O. Rugg, a composite course for junior high school proposed by L. C. Marshall, and a project to construct scientifically a fact course in social studies for elementary grades (as opposed to a problems course) proposed by Carleton Washburne. Interestingly, despite Gambrill's funding by the AHA for his research and report, all of the above had already been described in greater detail in the Twenty-second Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education in 1923 (H. Rugg, 1923).

At the same time, another concern of the now defunct Commission was being addressed by the AHA. Through the History Inquiry, first proposed at the AHA meeting of 1921 and formed at the 1922 meetings, the AHA sought "to ascertain the existing practice and tendencies of history teaching and social studies in the schools" (AHA, 1924, 82). With a grant of \$5,000 from the Bureau of Educational Research of Teachers College and a committee composed of Henry Johnson, J. Montgomery Gambrill, Daniel C. Knowlton, Albert E. McKinley, R. M. Tryon, G. F. Zook, William E. Lingelbach, chair, and Edgar Dawson, director of the investigation, the work commenced in October 1923, with a mandate to report its findings by December 28, 1924 (during the annual meeting in Richmond). Despite those time strictures, a report was published in The Historical Outlook in June 1924, indicating that less than a year was spent on the work. The forty-one page, double columned report had eight sections. The first five were background and summary, the sixth a "cross section of present curricula," the seventh was discussion of experimenting with a test of American history given to students in grades 11 or 12 in 36 schools in 6 states around the country. The last section was "general impressions,"

consisting of 12 agreed upon in January, barely 3 months after the committee commenced. Eleven had to do with specific course tendencies, and one, the twelfth, noted, "The training of teachers for the social studies, separately or as a group, is clearly in sad need of attention" (The Historical Outlook, 1924).

In 1924 NCSS was regularly represented in The Historical Outlook by Daniel Knowlton's regular column and J. Montgomery Gambrill's monthly book reviews. Arthur W. Dunn, one of the key members of the 1916 Committee on the Social Studies authored an article in the February issue. In April the Fourth Annual Meeting held in Chicago on the 25th and 26th of February was described. Earlier statements had placed this meeting to be located in Detroit, but there was a late change for some reason.

The meetings were held at the City Club of Chicago and Marshall, Howard Hill, Harold Rugg, Edgar Dawson and Rolla Tryon all appeared on the program of two speeches and three program sessions. It was noted that NCSS now had over 1000 members, but meeting attendance was not given.

In December 1924, NCSS met at the AHA/Virginia Society of History Teachers meetings in Richmond. This was the second year that this was formally done having begun in 1923 in Columbus at the joint AHA/APSA meetings.

#### NCSS Expands its Horizons—State Councils and a Developing Infrastructure

In December 1924 the news from the organizations column noted that state organizations were beginning to transform their history teachers groups into branches of NCSS as New York, Pennsylvania, Missouri and Dallas, Texas had already done. It was emphasized that NCSS was not trying to compete with local branches of history teachers and that such conversions were locally initiated.

Also noted was that accommodation difficulties were anticipated for Cincinnati's NEA Department of Superintendence meetings in February and that NCSS might consider formalizing July meetings at the NEA convention where more teachers could attend. Indeed, attending the NCSS meetings had been so difficult for all to attend that it had been impossible for the Board of Directors to yet meet all together.

Finally Dawson called for a better, more thorough survey than the recently completed History Inquiry. "There is a very general demand that the Council stimulate a more rapid approach to a formulation of objectives and of minimum essentials in the social studies" (386). That, too, would be on the docket for Cincinnati.

On page 423 of this issue of The Historical Outlook it was noted that beginning in 1925 the journal would go from nine to eight issues per year (dropping the June issue). This was being done at the request of NCSS as the journal was to serve as its official publication. The first issue of 1925 indicated that with both the NCSS and the AHA listed on the masthead.

The February issue described the upcoming NCSS program and the two constitutional amendments to be voted on in Cincinnati. One proposed that all actions taken at the annual meeting be printed in The Historical Outlook while the second addressed social ethics, proposing (for the second year in a row) that it be a part of the content of social studies.

At the meeting (reported in the April The Historical Outlook, 143) both amendments were tabled, primarily because it was felt not enough members were in attendance to make the vote a fair reflection of the overall membership. A resolution calling for standards for teaching social studies in high school, rather than just adherence to general standards was overwhelmingly passed. Dues were reduced from \$1 per year to 25¢, but \$2 more per year were required to receive The Historical Outlook.

Finally, and most significantly, six committees were formed and, in subsequent months would be filled, by NCSS members. These six were:

- 1) A committee on surveys and investigations
- 2) A committee to address legislations dealing with social studies
- 3) A committee to formulate standards for the teaching of social studies
- 4) A membership and affiliation committee
- 5) A committee on policies and plans
- 6) A finance committee

A seventh, on relations with The Historical Outlook was later added.

The July meeting of NCSS was held in Indianapolis with two themed sessions on training social studies teachers and their work. At that meeting the National Council officially became a part of the NEA as its Department of Social Studies and subsequent accounts of NCSS summer meetings were reported in the annual NEA Address and Proceedings under the Department of Social Studies. No report on that meeting was printed in The Historical Outlook, but in December, Secretary Dawson's report was unusually lengthy. In it he traced the first five years of NCSS, discussed the seven committees and their intended works and discussed the growth of membership. He reported that there were working organizations or sections of State Teachers Associations devoted to social studies in 33 states, none in 14 (and apparently no report from 1). These groups were listed on pages 398-401 with officer's names. Most of the officers are from high schools, but there is a smattering of college folk. Despite a national leadership of mostly college people, the state and local groups were dominated by high school personnel.

The end of Dawson's report was a draft of "Items for a Possible Platform" offered by the Committee on Standards of Teacher Training, chaired by Bessie Pierce who also served as vice president of the Council in 1925 and became president in 1926. This succession was not typical. Vanaria observed that early on, "No continuity or scheme seems to have guided the nomination

and election of officers. Not until 1930 did the vice president succeed to the presidency (with the exception of Pierce), thus establishing a precedent unbroken to the present" (128).

The teaching platform made ten points, the last of which was most interesting, i.e., "The teaching load for social studies in the high school should never exceed four periods a day" (Dawson, 1925, 401).

The committee on relations with The Historical Outlook began its "News of NCSS" column with the January 1926 The Historical Outlook. The sixth annual meeting was announced for Washington and the Committee appealed for volunteers from each region of the U. S. to help coordinate and encourage information flow to the Committee. By the end of 1926 the Committee's name had changed to one on Current Information and its column became, "Recent Happenings in Social Studies."

Each month the Committee tried to inform NCSS members of recent completed research including dissertations and theses, useful journal articles, other publications or materials of interest to the social studies teachers from the states or other sources, other organizations' work and the meetings of affiliated or allied unaffiliated groups.

The members of this Committee included Roy Hatch of the Horace Mann School of Teachers College, J. Lynn Barnard of the Pennsylvania Department of Public Instruction and a member of the 1916 committee on Social Studies, Richard Shryock, a professor of History at Duke, Charles Martz of the Cleveland School of Education, William Kimmel of the University of Chicago Lab Schools and the Committee's chair and Edna Stone, an Oakland (California) teacher. Ms. Stone had also been on the program for the February 1927 meeting held in Dallas and was elected vice president that year.

Bessie Pierce, first woman on the NCSS Board; Nellie Jackson, first female NCSS officer (Corresponding Secretary, 1923); Mary Carney (Corresponding Secretary, 1925-1927); Ruth West (1st vice president, 1938 but elected November 1937); and Stone constituted the women in officer positions in NCSS for the period 1921-1937.

At that Dallas meeting held at the Dallas YWCA where Stone was elected vice president, J. Montgomery Gambrill was chosen as president and an amendment to the constitution was passed to make NCSS official meetings in July, rather than February (Gambrill, 1928). Papers addressed research needed in social studies problems, objectives of social studies, significant activities in social studies teaching, types of thought questions and the training of the social studies teacher. Four committees also gave reports printed in the May The Historical Outlook.

In July 1927 NCSS met with the NEA in Seattle. In December NCSS apparently had minimal official presence at the AHA meetings at the University of Pennsylvania. The next annual meeting was held in February, 1928 at Boston University where one of the featured speakers was William Russell, Dean of Teachers College, Columbia.

At this meeting the topic of meeting time was again a source of debate as was a new constitution which was ratified and changed the nature of the NCSS Board of Directors. The raising of dues from \$2.25 to \$3 per year was also discussed but not decided upon.

An interesting feature in the "Recent Happenings in Social Studies" column was the number of articles in British journals cited and recommended by the committee. International ties among British and American history and social studies educators seemed regular and natural with no significant outreach noted in The Historical Outlook.

In July NCSS officially met, this time in Minneapolis and conducted significant business. The new Board, no longer explicitly bound to various social science organizations, was elected; dues were increased and the new officers included A. C. Krey, president; Edgar Dawson, 1st vice president; Rolla Tryon, 2nd vice president; and past president Bessie Pierce, secretary-treasurer (Dawson, 1928). An ad carried in the December 1928 The Historical Outlook (page 360) announced the changes in the new NCSS board and sought new members.

In February 1929, Krey penned an article reviewing changes in curriculum since the Committee of Seven of the AHA, thirty years before. Also in that month the organization met in Cleveland. In March it was noted that NCSS met in December with the AHA in Indianapolis. Thus, it would seem that NCSS continued to meet at AHA meetings despite no official reports of that contained in the AHA annual reports of the meetings of 1925, 1926 or 1927.

At the Indianapolis meeting A. C. Krey described and discussed the project of the Commission on the Social Studies of the AHA which Krey chaired and which was supported by a large grant from the Carnegie Foundation. During the 1930s, 17 volumes were published by the AHA under the Commission's direction and sponsorship.

As NCSS grew concerned with standards for social studies and social studies teachers, states and large cities like Los Angeles reflected that concern and developed their own standards. This was reported in a number of the "Recent Happenings. . ." columns during this same year.

At the end of the year, NCSS met again at the AHA meetings held at Duke University in December. The Commission on the Social Studies report was a continued lively topic of debate and discussion and would continue to be for at least the next five years. At that AHA meeting Krey announced that the Commission had met on its own in November in New York City and approved a testing program. The Commission's Advisory Committees which included objectives, tests, public relations were listed along with the members of those committees. These included Charles Beard, Boyd Bode, Harold Rugg and Krey on objectives; Howard Hill, Ernest Horn, Henry Johnson and Krey on tests; and Robert Lynd, Krey and Jesse Newlon on public relations.

The above information was discussed in the January 1930 The Historical Outlook, but in February the Duke meeting was still of notice. The NCSS sessions were described and it was

noted that "both joint sessions and the luncheon conference were well attended with the largest attendance since the organization of the National Council for the Social Studies" (Recent, 1930, 78). Edgar Dawson was elected president, Rolla Tryon, first vice president, De Witt Morgan from Arsenal Technical High School in Indianapolis was second vice president and Bessie Pierce, now at the University of Chicago, continued as secretary-treasurer.

Also noted in February was the upcoming NCSS meeting in Atlantic City, nine years after the first NCSS meeting held there. Two classroom symposia on classroom difficulties, one on subject matter to be held in the morning, the other on teaching procedures, slated for the afternoon, were to comprise the program.

The April The Historical Outlook briefly reviewed the Atlantic City meetings and noted one of the earliest student summer programs. The Seventh Annual session of the School of International Studies in Geneva was to be held July 14 to September 5 with over 450 college students converging from nearly 40 countries (Recent, April 1930, 175). During part of that time NCSS would again meet with the NEA, June 30-July 1 in Columbus, Ohio.

The October The Historical Outlook did not discuss the NCSS summer meetings, but the "Recent Happenings . . ." column did describe the completed dissertation study of Laurence Shaffer. This was one of the studies carried out by the team of Harold Rugg (see Nelson, 1977). Earlier dissertation studies by Neal Billings (February 1930), C. O. Matthews (November 1927), and Hyman Meltzer (January 1927), other members of the Rugg team had been reported in the "Recent Happenings . . ." column.

In December 1930, NCSS met again with the AHA in Boston; the meetings were described in February as was the upcoming meeting planned for Detroit that month. In April Bessie Pierce reported on that meeting which had as its focus the Commission on the Social Studies work and the "first" NCSS Yearbook, Some Aspects of the Social Sciences in the Schools. Apparently institutional memory was short since the other first NCSS Yearbook of December, 1922 also examined the social sciences. On the listed program were ten people, five from schools and five from colleges.

The summer meetings of NCSS were held in Los Angeles in 1931 at UCLA and at Jackson Junior College, Long Beach. According to The Historical Outlook (October 1931, 297) two to three hundred people attended the NCSS luncheon. A consistent core of attendees now populated NCSS meetings and after a membership peak of 2000 in 1929, the depression caused a decline which bottomed out at 700 in 1934 (Vanaria, 105).

In December NCSS met with the AHA in Minneapolis, a meeting which focused on the teaching of history in secondary schools of France, Germany, England and Mexico. Both A.C. Krey and Edgar Wesley made presentations to the AHA and they encouraged of a young

graduate students of theirs, Wilbur Murra, who would become the first executive secretary of NCSS in 1939. (AHA, 1931 and Murra, 1994).

During the depression, regional and state groups seemed to grow while the National Council declined, a reflection of ever tightening travel funds. The Commission on the Social Studies continued to be the primary topic of interest, but judging by the "Recent Happenings in Social Studies" column, other interests were emerging. These included broadcasting in the school, the League of Nations, the activities of colleagues in Great Britain and civic education by radio. The year 1932 saw a growing concern with social studies by college educators in social science fields. Formation of an Intercollegiate Council of the Social Studies was announced in March, though its meetings were never reported and the group may have faded quickly. In October the Third Annual Conference on Teaching of the Social Studies was announced. The meeting, to be held March 25-26, 1933, at Northwestern would have representation from 48 colleges.

Still, the big news of 1932 was the publication of Commission books by Charles Beard, A Charter for the Social Studies in the Schools, and Henry Johnson, An Introduction to the History of the Social Sciences in Schools. The February meeting was held in Washington, the July meeting in Atlantic City and the December meeting in Toronto.

One noted publication of 1932, by an NCSS member and discussed in the January, 1933, The Historical Outlook was Dare the Schools Build a New Social Order? by George S. Counts. This publication and Counts' thoughts were reflective of the dominant thinking among NCSS leaders as evidenced by articles and comments in The Historical Outlook. Interestingly the bulletins of NCSS, begun in 1927, made no reference nor allusion to the severe economic and social conditions of the Great Depression. Bulletin topics included Textbooks, Historical Fiction, Tests, Reading in Social Studies, Methods of Teaching and Pamphlets on Public Affairs. Four of these first eight bulletins were edited by women with one co-edited.

The year 1933 was also dominated by the Commission and in the April The Historical Outlook, A. C. Krey listed the fifteen reports (subsequently 17) in order of publication. Also in that April issue was an announcement of the third NCSS Yearbook, Supervision in the Social Studies, edited by W. G. Kimmel. Meetings were held in Minneapolis in February, Chicago in July and Urbana in December. In October the "Recent Happenings . . ." column had a plea from the Committee, now chaired by Howard Wilson, for more news for the column to be sent to any of the Committee members, now numbering 19, up from the original total of five.

Also noted was the success of the July NCSS meetings in Chicago. "Three hundred were at sessions with several hundred others turned away because of lack of space in rooms," at the Stevens Hotel (now the Conrad Hilton) on Michigan Avenue. An open letter to teachers of the social studies from Edgar Wesley, second vice president of NCSS, in that same issue of The

Historical Outlook, appealed for more members, enumerating reasons for teachers to join. He mentioned the three meetings per year, the dues of \$3 and the Council publications thus far (Wesley, 1933).

#### Big Changes in the Council

In 1934 there was a considerable change in educational management of NCSS and its publication, The Historical Outlook. In the January edition of The Social Studies, it was explained that under an agreement worked out between the AHA, NCSS and McKinley Publishing (the publisher of The Historical Outlook) the AHA with the advice and cooperation of NCSS would assume the financing and editorial management of the journal, which would now be called The Social Studies. The AHA would use its surplus funds from the Commission on the Social Studies to defray editorial expenses. New editorial board representatives would come from the American Economic Association, the American Political Science Association and the American Sociological Society.

Vanaria notes (164) that McKinley's deal with the AHA was done without consulting the officers of the Council and he cites a letter from Pierce to Dawson of May 3, 1933, stating that. This led to much grumbling among the officers about a lost opportunity to take over the journal or to start a new one.

At that time, however, any new expenditures were impossible for the Council to consider. In 1932-33 NCSS had income of \$1544 and expenses of \$1183. A major reason for this shortage of funds, was that the Farmers Loan and Trust of Iowa City closed in January 1932, tying up Council funds of \$1365.62. In December the bank paid \$136.56— 10% of the deposit (Vanaria, 165).

The 1934 meetings were held in Cleveland in February (300 attendees) and Washington in both July and December. Despite the difficult economic times, some interesting seminars were being offered in the "Recent Happenings . . ." column. A Cuban seminar in Havana was noted in January; ones in Mexico and Moscow were noted in April.

Once again, Commission activities were highlighted with papers addressing the varying reports on the social studies. At all three NCSS meetings the reports were on the agenda with educator responses in July, reviews of the reports in December as well as meetings on the topic in December.

Just as Wesley had done, R. O. Hughes, NCSS second vice president wrote an open letter in the November The Social Studies urging social studies teachers to join or rejoin NCSS. He listed upcoming meetings and urged "you" to attend and join NCSS. Announced in that issue was a history of NCSS to be authored by Edgar Dawson. Only one further mention of it ever appears in NCSS announcements.

A call for proposals for the fifth Yearbook of NCSS, The Historical Approach to Methods of Teaching the Social Studies, appeared in May and an announcement of the Yearbook in December. Of more NCSS concern, however, was the proposed Fourteenth Yearbook of the Department of Superintendence of NEA to be published in 1936, which was on The Social Studies Curriculum and whose list of prospective authors had no specialist in either social studies or social sciences ("Recent Happenings. . .," April 1934, 186). This literary lobbying apparently helped because when the 14th Yearbook was published, it included chapters by Charles Beard, George Counts and Howard Wilson, all prominent social studies figures. Murra, in reviewing this yearbook, compared it to the AHA Commission report, highlighting similarities and differences between the two. He noted that, "The practical usefulness of the yearbook, with its material that can be applied to immediate problems of curriculum construction, will fill a need that the Report of the American Historical Association Commission failed to provide for." (Murra, 1936, 28). Indeed, Murra saw the yearbook as "the most comprehensive and most usable treatment of the subject available." (Murra, 1936, 10).

In December of 1934 at the NCSS meetings in Washington it was proposed that "NCSS hold a two day session on the Friday and Saturday following Thanksgiving." Such a meeting would be similar to the regular meetings of the National Council of English Teachers ("Recent Happenings . . .," February 1935, 120). It was later in 1935 that NCSS held its first, "stand alone" meeting in New York, November 29-30. So successful was this deemed by the NCSS leadership that the practice was repeated in Detroit in 1936, and in St. Louis the following year, establishing a tradition of November meetings that continues today.

The proposed history of NCSS was revisited in February 1935 when Dawson appealed for help and cooperation in this endeavor. In less than charming tones, he wrote "Are you a democrat or a fascist? This is a democratic experiment" (Dawson, 1935, 124).

The February meeting in Atlantic City had on its program of about ten presenters well-known and "well connected" NCSS members—Howard Wilson of Harvard, president and future secretary-treasurer of NCSS; Daniel Knowlton of Teachers College, Columbia, Yale and NYU; W. Linwood Chase, a young professor from Boston University and a future NCSS President; Edgar Wesley of Minnesota, NCSS first vice-president; Roy Price, then of North High School in Quincy, MA, later of Syracuse University and NCSS president in 1942; R. O. Hughes of the Pittsburgh Schools, long-time NCSS board member and officer. It was at this meeting that a small experimental meeting was agreed upon for November 29, 30, 1935 in NYC.

Wesley, in particular, was most active in Council outreach pursuits. After his letter in The Historical Outlook seeking more members he then decided to be even more pro-active. The March issue of The Social Studies noted that he would visit as president local councils to speak

about NCSS and to listen to various council concerns ("Recent Happenings. . .," March 1935, 198). His speaking schedule appeared in the October The Social Studies.

From 1935 to 1937 (and beyond) one of the biggest issues that concerned NCSS and social studies educators was loyalty oaths. New York State seemed to have the most legislation addressing that topic and the most resistance among social studies educators. April and May columns addressed this most seriously and the concern grew by October.

The October issue of The Social Studies described the summer meeting held in Denver. So crowded was the Monday afternoon meeting that, "It had to be moved from the library of East High School to the main auditorium" ("Recent Happenings. . .," October 1935, 412). The number attending was estimated at 500.

It was also noted that there were changes in the "Recent Happenings in Social Studies" column which would now be coordinated in the NCSS editorial offices, rather than by the Committee.

The December meeting of the AHA in Chattanooga was again combined with NCSS, but other social sciences—American Political Science Association (APSA), National Council for Geographic Education (NCGE), American Economics Association (AEA), American Sociological Society (ASS)—also met at Christmas time in other locations of the country.

In the January 1936 The Social Studies, Wilbur Murra reviewed the first independent meeting of NCSS and found it wonderful. "(T)he richness of simultaneous programs presented problems of choice, and not a few members tried to hear parts of different programs which were in progress at the same time" (Murra, 4). Murra also noted the delegates that attended from cooperating organizations. "It is probable that the custom of designating delegates will be developed more fully and much of the business of the Council will be handled by them in the future" (Murra, 4). A most insightful, accurate comment, to be sure.

Loyalty oaths, "red restrictions," the American Legion, fascism, student oaths, censorship and student spies were discussed in January, February, March, April, May and October issues of The Social Studies. At the Portland meeting two American Legion officers announced that the Legion now opposed loyalty oaths as un-American, though the Legion continued to closely monitor school programs.<sup>1</sup> Nothing else seemed to have as much import until the end of 1936 when significant changes began to swiftly affect NCSS.

The meeting of June in Portland and the upcoming one for Detroit in November were duly discussed, but NCSS changes now took center stage. Erling Hunt became editor of The Social Studies, effective August 15, 1936, and this was announced in the October 1936 issue. In November, Hunt explained the changes. W. G. Kimmel, who had begun as associate editor of

<sup>1</sup> See Gellerman, William (1938). The American Legion as Educator. Columbia: Teachers College.

The Social Studies in 1934, and upon Albert McKinley's death in February 1935, had become editor, resigned in the summer of 1936 in order to become associate editor of John C. Winston Company in Philadelphia. This also necessitated Kimmel's resignation as associate in Civic Education at Teachers College, Columbia. To assist Hunt, Katherine Crane with a recent Ph.D. in history from the University of Chicago and a former secondary school teacher, was named associate editor.

The December 1936 issue of The Social Studies was the last to be published under the aegis of the AHA and beginning in January, 1937 the official journal of NCSS would be Social Education, which would have editorial offices at Columbia under the editorial supervision of the AHA. Hunt would be editor and chair of the Executive Board. Crane would shift with Hunt to Social Education as Associate Editor. The AHA still needed Commission royalties to publish Social Education and the headquarters of the secretary-treasurer of NCSS would continue to be at Harvard where it had been since January 1936, and where Howard Wilson was ensconced. Wilson's term ended in 1939, but the headquarters of NCSS remained at Harvard with Wilbur Murra as the elected secretary treasurer. In 1940 NCSS moved to the NEA Building in Washington and a much tighter NCSS-NEA relationship was forged.

The year 1937 seemed to be a year of "settling into" a more independent stature and no burning council issues seemed to emerge. Meetings were held in New Orleans in February, Detroit in June, St. Louis in November and Philadelphia in December. Rather than just nominate and elect officers at the November meeting, the first nominating committee was appointed in September consisting of A. C. Krey, Florence Tryon and Howard Cummings. They were to report a slate for the St. Louis meeting. NCSS seemed to have reached some independent stature as an organization and was poised for growth and more active work in schools as 1938 began.

#### Assessing the Period, 1921-1937

The National Council for the Social Studies began as a service organization that would both bridge the gap between social scientists and secondary school teachers and reexamine knowledge within the disciplines in light of potential use in schools. Founded by five practitioner-researchers, the organization was swiftly taken over by two hard working entrepreneurs. Neither researchers nor scholars, McKinley and Dawson seemed to possess little vision other than an organizing spirit and NCSS emerged directionless from its birth.

Despite its lack of intellectual purpose, NCSS struck a responsive chord to many in higher education who had a deep interest in social sciences in schools. At a time when the NEA, the AHA, the APSA, the AEA and the ASS had "stakes" in the school curriculum "game," the

creation of NCSS allowed for all parties to meet on a neutral field. NCSS was swiftly accepted as an objective broker of the issues of social science teaching in schools.

The choice of the term, "social studies," as noted previously was seen as reflective of this inclusive, neutral stance by the organization's founders, but early on was perceived as a "sticking point" by some parties. By the late 1920s the AHA softened its stance against the term, probably because it saw itself losing this battle, trivial though it might be.

With the concession by the AHA and its subsequent naming of a Commission on Social Studies in 1928 to continue the work of the Committee on History Teaching in the Schools, the term "social studies" became not only accepted, but preferred. The Commission's work led by a number of prominent historians like Guy Stanton Ford and A. C. Krey of Minnesota, Carlton Hayes and Charles Beard of Columbia and other social scientists like geographer Isaiah Bowman and political scientist Charles Merriam lent credence to social studies, and by associative extension to NCSS.

NCSS early allied itself with both the NEA and the AHA. Though never a formal part of the latter, the AHA provided financial and publishing support for many years, even though from 1925 to 1969, NCSS was officially a part of the NEA as its Department of Social Studies. The NCSS was neither fish nor fowl and this had its advantages and disadvantages.

For the first ten years of its organizational life, NCSS campaigned for members to give real life to the association. By the late 1920s, NCSS seemed to be catching on with teachers, this despite the fact that the group was largely run by a small group of higher educators and an assortment of school people.

Intellectually the group was stunted early on, but in the 1930s attracted educators and social scientists with more pronounced academic views and involvement. The organization was predominantly a voice of progressivism and liberal political views. The more intellectual educators and social scientists came to NCSS with a hope for the improvement of schools and society. Unfortunately, their involvement seems to be aroused indifference more than organizational actions. "They simply weren't listened to and they simply stopped their involvement with NCSS" (Engle, 1994).

NCSS had a few women officers in its early years and active involvement by women on both Committees and Yearbook chapters. The journal The Historical Outlook and, later The Social Studies also was an obvious outlet for publication by women in social science disciplines and in school positions.

Despite the best of intentions NCSS struggled for acceptance, membership, intellectual respect and a political voice in the debates on schools in the period 1921 to 1937. It would seem that in the nearly sixty years since, little has changed. It is a disheartening observation, but one grounded in historical and contemporary realities.

# NCSS MEETING SITES—1921-1937

March 1921  
 February 1922  
 February 24, 1923  
 July 2-3, 1923  
 December 27, 1923  
 February 25, 1924  
 June 29-July 4, 1924  
 December 1924  
 February 21, 1925  
 July 2-3, 1925  
 December 29-31, 1925  
 February 20-21, 1926  
 June 29/July 5, 1926  
 December 28-30, 1926  
 February 27, 1927  
 July 3-8, 1927  
 December 28-30, 1927  
 February 25, 1928  
 July 1928  
 December 28, 29, 1928  
 February 25, 1929  
 June 28-July 3, 1929  
 December 30, 1929  
 February 22, 1930  
 June 30-July 1, 1930  
 December 29-31, 1930  
 February 2, 1931  
 June 27-July 3, 1931  
 December 28-30, 1931  
 February 20-25, 1932  
 June 25-July 1932  
 December 27-29, 1932  
 February 25-March 2, 1933  
 July 1-7, 1933  
 December 27-29, 1933  
 February 25-28, 1934  
 June 30-July 6, 1934  
 December 27-29, 1934  
 February 24-28, 1935  
 June 30-July 5, 1935  
 November 29-30, 1935  
 December 27-30, 1935  
 February 22-27, 1936  
 June 28-July 2, 1936  
 November 26-28, 1936  
 December 29-31, 1936  
 February 20-25, 1937  
 June 27-July 1, 1937  
 November 1937  
 December 28-31, 1937

Atlantic City\*  
 Chicago—Central YMCA\*  
 Cleveland—Hotel Cleveland\*  
 Oakland, San Francisco—Hotel Whitcomb  
 Columbus, Ohio—Hotel Deshler—AHA  
 Chicago—City Club of Chicago\*  
 Washington, D.C.  
 Richmond—With AHA  
 Cincinnati\*  
 Indianapolis—Created Dept. of SS  
 Ann Arbor, Michigan—University of Michigan—AHA  
 Lafayette—Washington Hotel\*  
 Philadelphia  
 Rochester, New York—Hotel Seneca—AHA  
 Dallas—YWCA\*  
 Seattle  
 Washington, D.C.—Willard Hotel—AHA  
 Boston—Boston University  
 Minneapolis—Old Central Lutheran Church\*  
 Indianapolis—With the AHA  
 Cleveland  
 Atlanta—Trinity Methodist  
 Durham, North Carolina—Duke University\*—AHA  
 Atlantic City—JHS Auditorium  
 Columbus  
 AHA—Boston—Jacob Sleeper Hall, BU\*  
 Detroit—Masonic Temple and Ft. Wayne Hotel  
 Los Angeles—UCLA & Jackson JC-Long Beach  
 Minneapolis\*—Nicollet Hotel—AHA  
 Washington, D.C.  
 Atlantic City—Ambassador Hotel  
 Toronto—AHA\*  
 Minneapolis  
 Chicago—Stevens Hotel (Conrad Hilton)  
 Urbana—University of Illinois\*—AHA  
 Cleveland  
 Washington, D.C.  
 Washington, D.C.—Mayflower Hotel\*  
 Atlantic City  
 Denver—East High School, Capitol Life Ins. Bldg.  
 New York City\*—Hotel Pennsylvania  
 Chattanooga—Read House (elected officers)—AHA  
 St. Louis—Jefferson Hotel  
 Portland, Oregon—First Baptist Church  
 Detroit—Hotel Statler\*  
 Providence, Rhode Island—Brown University—AHA  
 New Orleans—Roosevelt Hotel & Municipal Auditorium  
 Detroit—Cass Technical High School, Hotel Wardell, Wayne University  
 St. Louis—Hotel Jefferson\*  
 Philadelphia—Bellevue Stratford Hotel—AHA

\*Official Meetings of NCSS

NCSS Presidents 1921-1937

1921	Albert McKinley
1922	Leon C. Marshall (U of C)
1923	William H. Hathaway
1924	Thomas J. McCormack
1925	Howard C. Hill
1925	Bessie L. Pierce
1927	J. Montgomery Gambrill
1928—1929	August C. Krey
1930	Edgar Dawson
1931	Rolla Tryon
1932	DeWitt S. Morgan
1933	William G. Kimmel
1934	Howard E. Wilson
1935	Edgar B. Wesley
1936	Ray O. Hughes
1937	Elmer Ellis

### References

- American Historical Association Annual Report, 1921 Washington, D.C.
- American Historical Association Annual Report, 1922 Washington, D.C.
- American Historical Association Annual Report, 1923 Washington, D.C.
- American Historical Association Annual Report, 1931 Washington, D.C.
- A National Council for the Social Studies (1921). The Historical Outlook, 12(4), 144.
- Boozar, H. R. (1960). The AHA and the Schools. Unpublished dissertation, Washington University, St. Louis.
- Correia, S. (1993). For Their Own Good: An Historical Analysis of the Educational Thought of Thomas Jesse Jones. Unpublished dissertation, the Pennsylvania State University.
- Dawson, E. (December 1921). An organization to promote the social studies. The Historical Outlook, 12(8) 330-331.
- Dawson, E. (December 1922). The plans of the national council for the social studies. The Historical Outlook, 13(8) 317-321.
- Dawson, E. (March 1922) The national council is growing. The Historical Outlook, 13(3) 107.
- Dawson, E. (February 1922). The national council again. The Historical Outlook, 13(2), 46-49.
- Dawson, E. (December 1925). Report of the NCSS secretary. The Historical Outlook, 16(8), 395-401.
- Dawson, E. (October 1928). Eighth Annual Meeting of the National Council for the Social Studies. The Historical Outlook, 19(6), 280-283.
- Dawson, E. (1935). Proposed history of NCSS. The Social Studies, 26(2), 124.
- Engle, S. (1994). Phone conversation with author. February 17, 8:00 to 8:20 EST.
- Gambrill, J. M. (May 1928). Proposed reorganization of the National Council for the Social Studies. The Historical Outlook, 19(5), 221-222.
- Keels, O.M. (Sept. - Oct. 1994) "In the Beginning - Albert McKinley and the Founding of The Social Studies, 85 (5), 198 - 205.
- Lybarger, M. (1981). Origins of the Social Studies Curriculum: 1865-1916. Unpublished dissertation, University of Wisconsin-Madison.
- Murra, W. (January 1936). The New York meeting of the National Council for the Social Studies. The Social Studies, 27(1), 1-5.
- Murra, W. (1936). "The Social Studies Curriculum-A Review," The League Scrip, Minneapolis Teachers' League, Minneapolis.
- Murra, W. (1970). "The Birth of the NCSS--As Remembered by Earle U. Rugg", Social Education, 34(7), 728-729

- Nelson, M. (1977). The development of the Rugg social studies program. Theory and Research in Social Education, 5(3), 64-83.
- Murra, W. (November 19, 1994). Interview with Murry R. Nelson, Foundation of Social Studies SIG Business Meeting, NCSS Annual Meeting, Phoenix, AZ.
- "News of Associations" (May, 1923) The Historical Outlook, 14(5), 190-191.
- Recent happenings in the social studies. (February 1930) The Historical Outlook, 21(2), 78.
- Recent happenings in the social studies. (February 1930) The Historical Outlook, 26(2), 412.
- Recent happenings in the social studies. (April 1934) The Historical Outlook, 25(4)
- Report of the Joint Commission on Presentation of Social Studies in the Schools (February 1923). The Historical Outlook, 14(2) 53-54.
- Rugg, E. (1921, May). A National Council for the Social Studies. The Historical Outlook, 12(5), 190.
- Rugg, E. (1966). Audio tape recorded. Greeley, Co.
- Rugg, H. (Ed.) (1923). The Social Studies. Twenty-second annual yearbook (Part II) of the National Society for the Study of Education, Bloomington, IL.
- Saxe, D. (1991). Social Studies in Schools. Albany: SUNY Press.
- Social studies in the summer schools. (June 1922). The Historical Outlook, 13(6), 227
- Vanaria, L. (1958). The National Council for the Social Studies: A Voluntary Organization for Professional Service. Unpublished dissertation, Columbia University.
- Wesley, E. (October 1933). An open letter. The Historical Outlook, 24(6), 332-333.